International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research Vol. 23, No. 12, pp. 382-401, December 2024 https://doi.org/10.26803/ijlter.23.12.20 Received Aug 12, 2024; Revised Nov 27, 2024; Accepted Dec 29, 2024

Participatory Action Research as a Catalyst to **Enabling Conditions Conducive to Sustainable** Learning in Economics

Habasisa Molise* University of Limpopo Polokwane, South Africa

Abstract. This study sought to explore the potential of participatory action research (PAR) as a catalyst for enabling conditions conducive to sustainable learning in economics, focusing on the experiences of secondary school learners and teachers in Thabo-Mofutsanyane Education District. Critical emancipatory research (CER) was adopted for this study based on its objective of engaging marginalised individuals so that their voices can be heard and respected. CER contributed to advance the agenda of human emancipation regardless of status and strives to attain peace, freedom, hope, social justice, and equity in all its forms. The study was conducted based on a qualitative methodology, grounded in a PAR framework. Ten purposively sampled participants from a high school in Free State Province in the Thabo-Mofutsanyane Education District, South Africa were selected for the study. Data were generated using the free attitude interview technique, which incorporated dialogue and focus group discussions. The collected data were then analysed using critical discourse analysis (CDA). The findings indicated that collaborative learning, parental involvement, motivated teachers and learners and lesson preparation as key conditions conducive to sustainable learning in economics. Recommendations included schools and educators actively fostering a collaborative/supportive classroom atmosphere, teacher and learner motivation, effective lesson preparation, and encouraging parental participation in the learning process to promote sustainable learning.

Keywords: economics, conditions conducive, critical discourse, free attitude interview, participatory action research, sustainable learning

@Authors

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0).

^{*}Corresponding author: Habasisa Molise; vincent.molise@ul.ac.za

1. Introduction

A lack of fundamental prerequisites for effective teaching, such as interactive dialogue, problem-based learning, and contextualised illustrations, poses a significant threat to effective economics teaching. This issue is compounded by factors such as limited resources, an outdated curriculum, and poor teacher training. Ideally, economics educators should intentionally discover the fundamental criteria for effective economics instruction. However, based on the researcher's experience as an economics educator, many economics instructors overlook essential elements for the sustained and effective instruction of the topic. In the absence of educational institutions and instructors actively cultivating conditions conducive to sustainable learning in economics, learners have exhibited reduced motivation, low self-esteem, a lack of academic and social competencies, poor performance, and high dropout rates.

Numerous studies consistently highlight the importance of collaborative learning in modern educational environments. A study by Ariani and Valiantien (2022) demonstrated that the establishment of collaborative learning settings significantly enhanced learners' problem-solving skills and academic engagement levels. Similarly, Ramdani and Susilo's (2022) research indicated that the application of collaborative learning methodologies led to increased learner engagement and reduced dropout rates in online courses. Other studies continually emphasised the significance of parental involvement in contemporary educational settings. A study by Myende and Nhlumayo (2020) affirmed that parental engagement significantly boosts learner achievement, particularly in reading and mathematics. In support, Mbhiza and Nkambule (2023) revealed a positive correlation between parental involvement and learner motivation, selfesteem, and social competencies. Studies by Christian and Sayed (2023) and Zhang and Liu (2019) showed a significant influence of teacher motivation on learner engagement, academic performance, and teacher efficacy. Conversely, unmotivated teachers might adversely impact learner performance (Kim, 2020). The need for thorough lesson planning in contemporary educational settings was also highlighted, with Krepf and König's (2022) discovery that meticulously structured courses significantly enhanced learner engagement, academic achievement, and instructor confidence (Manzoor, Tufal, & Hayat, 2024). Thus, empirical research emphasises the significance of motivation in contemporary educational settings.

Amartey and Yalley (2020) contend that elevated levels of comprehension necessitate active engagement in the application and use of concepts. Active participation in the learning process appears to be beneficial, especially when learners are acquiring problem-solving skills (Mizzi, 2024). Furthermore, learners must engage with real-life examples to cultivate a deeper sense of the applicability of the subjects they study (Wyk, 2015). This is crucial as they consistently make economic decisions when purchasing products and services and engage in activities analogous to small enterprises, such as fundraising (Adu & Zondo, 2023). The discipline of economics addresses the challenges that learners encounter in their daily lives and should consequently be taught in a manner that enables them to readily connect classroom learning with real-world situations, which,

regrettably, is not consistently achieved. As a result, contemporary economic events must be integrated into the classroom to address the deficiencies in learners' real-world experience (Mizzi, 2022), thus enhancing their motivation to learn. Nonetheless, Shanks (2020) observes that economics is frequently presented as a sterile, analytical discipline that is challenging for learners to connect with daily life. Therefore, Mizzi (2023) maintains that effective economics instruction for high school learners necessitates making the topic relevant, a task made easier by their everyday exposure to economic concepts.

PAR has emerged as a potent catalyst for fostering sustainable learning environments, particularly in economics education (Alejandra & Walker, 2020). However, research indicates that traditional teaching methods often fail to engage students, leading to poor academic outcomes and diminished interest in economics (Amartey & Yalley, 2020). In Ghana, inadequate resources, insufficient teacher training, and a dearth of contextual relevance in economics education exacerbate this issue (Adu & Zondo, 2022). According to Anwar, Ansari, Husniah, and Asmara (2022), students' attitudes toward economics are influenced by teaching methods, curriculum relevance, and teacher-student interactions. The consequences of ineffective economics education are far-reaching, including financial illiteracy, poor economic decision-making, and limited civic engagement (Alejandra & Walker, 2020; Amalia, Widiati, Basthomi, & Cahyono, 2020). PAR offers a promising solution, enabling students and teachers to co-create knowledge, identify challenges, and develop context-specific solutions (Davis & Luke, 2021; Daire, Carlson, & Pointer, 2023). By fostering collaborative inquiry, critical thinking, and collective action, PAR can cultivate sustainable learning environments conducive to economics education (Ariani & Valiantien, 2022; Christian & Sayed, 2023; Anwar et al., 2021).

Adu and Zondo's (2023) research delved into the realm of economics education, a pressing concern emerges: traditional teaching methods often fail to engage students, leading to poor academic outcomes and diminished interest in economics. This issue was particularly pronounced in Ghanaian senior high schools, where inadequate resources and insufficient teacher training compounded the problem. Despite extensive research on economics education, a significant gap exists in applying PAR in this context. PAR's emphasis on collaborative inquiry and knowledge co-creation offers a promising solution to the challenges plaguing economics education (Bendien, Groot, & Abma, 2022). Yet, few studies have explored PAR's effectiveness in improving economic education outcomes, particularly in African contexts. The present study sought to address this gap by investigating PAR's application in economics education, shedding light on participatory approaches' potential benefits in enhancing learners' engagement and academic outcomes (Christian & Sayed, 2023). Therefore, this study aimed to answer the following research question: How does PAR facilitate conducive conditions that promote sustainable learning in economics?

2. Literature Review

2.1 Participatory Action Research

PAR advances social justice by establishing settings that enhance empowerment (Pillay, 2018; MacDonald, 2012). The term indicates involvement and action, representing a study methodology concerning a group of individuals impacted by a certain problem or issue who convene to determine their approach to addressing it and thereafter take action (Pillay, 2018). The fundamental components of this inquiry approach are comprehension, collaborative engagement, transformation, and a process that fosters individual development (MacDonald, 2012). Puri (2023) states that PAR originated in the 1960s and 1970s through initiatives involving marginalised populations. A core principle is that community members facing particular issues can analyse them and gain the agency to identify solutions (Bendien et al., 2022). In PAR, solutions are generated by community members and negotiated among all participants, as opposed to solutions dictated by authority or external agents (Padayachee, Maistry, Harris, & Lortan, 2023). This is a collaborative endeavour aimed at resolving difficulties inside a particular system, characterised by a cyclical, reflective research design that emphasises problem-solving, enhancing work practices, and comprehending the impact of the research or intervention as an integral component of the research process.

PAR expressly advocates for understanding the effects of change and adjusting activities accordingly. As stated by Alejandra and Walker (2020), the PAR technique aims to enhance individuals' awareness of the limitations that hinder their full participation in their communities within a certain temporal and spatial context (Bendien et al., 2022). It aims to empower them to act in order to eradicate or mitigate those limits. A primary objective of PAR is activism (Hamilton, Morgan, Murphy, & Harland, 2024), which involves learners in intricate roles and leadership opportunities, supplemented by adequate adult mentorship to aid the exploration of conflicts of interest to enhance learning and mitigate challenges and setbacks, while concurrently leveraging social networks to connect them with individuals directly engaged in the research issue (Hamilton et al., 2024). Essential to this endeavour is the promotion of transformative change. Palka (2024) contends that within a PAR paradigm, knowledge is generated by collaboration, engagement, and action, and evolves within the research process. A defining characteristic of PAR is its emphasis on knowledge generation and action through the significant involvement of marginalised individuals and groups in society (Padayachee et al., 2023). As collaborators with people in authority, they shape and influence decisions regarding effective teaching and learning processes (Spencer, Leonard, Jessiman, Kaluževičiūtė-Moreton, Limmer, & Kidger, 2024).

PAR empowers participants in three significant ways, including enhancing their sense of capability and confidence, facilitating their exercise of genuine political influence, and developing skills applicable to other self-directed initiatives. White (2022) argues that PAR is a theory of change that colonisation has sought to suppress through fear and shame; yet, when adopted, it can provide outcomes of justice and peace. Through PAR, educators are empowered to engage in decisions pertaining to classroom and school policies (Davis & Luke, 2021), governance and

administration matters, and curriculum development. Educators are able to participate in decision-making at elevated levels, specifically within districts and provinces, via their professional associations (Keahey, 2021). They can also participate in decision-making regarding policies and various issues, including classroom discipline policies, selection of learning materials, structuring of learning activities, course offerings, school discipline and promotion policies, scheduling of learner time, class size, recruitment and selection of teachers, teacher redeployment, salary schedules, employment benefits, and school finances (Davis & Luke, 2021). PAR augments participants' critical awareness and resources, including knowledge, social networks, and community cohesion. When individuals elevate their consciousness, they enhance their knowledge of power dynamics and critically assess their social resources. This technique permits the construction of structures via PAR and empowers individuals to address perceived injustices (Dusty, 2024).

2.2 Conditions conducive to sustainable learning in Economics

2.2.1 Collaborative learning

Collaborative learning is recognised as an effective educational approach that enhances academic achievement, fosters social skills, and develops critical thinking (Mundelsee & Jurkowski, 2021). A study by Warsah, Morganna, Uyun, and Afandi (2021) showed that the establishment of collaborative learning settings significantly enhanced learners' problem-solving skills and academic interest levels. Collaborative learning derives its effectiveness from its ability to create a supportive learning community where learners share knowledge and experiences (Nazeef, Khan, & Ali, 2024). Warsah et al. (2021) suggest that parents, educators, and learners must collaborate to identify concerns, challenges, and concepts inherent in the educational environment, as well as to interrogate injustices common within the education system (Anwar et al., 2021). Ariani and Valiantien (2022) believe that collaborative teaching and learning provide teachers and learners with the time and opportunity to orally communicate ideas and explore economic issues together. A study by Ariani and Valiantien (2022) further demonstrated the effectiveness of collaborative teaching and learning in economics, providing teachers and learners with opportunities to orally communicate ideas and explore economic issues. Amartey and Yalley (2020), too, found that collaborative learning approaches in economics education improved learners' understanding of complex economic concepts.

2.2.2 Parental involvement

Numerous studies have consistently demonstrated that parental engagement is crucial for improving children's academic performance and social development (Panaoura, 2021). A study by Myende and Nhlumayo (2020) indicated that parental engagement significantly enhances learner achievement, particularly in reading and mathematics. An inquiry by Mbhiza and Nkambule (2023) and Jacobs (2023) established that parental involvement in homework and academic endeavours significantly enhances learner performance, particularly among disadvantaged learners (Singh, Banerjee, & Bandyopadhyay, 2022). The effectiveness of parental involvement derives from its ability to create a supportive educational environment that extends beyond the classroom

(Simweleba & Serpell, 2020). Jacobs (2024) contends that parental involvement in their children's education is essential for identifying concerns, challenges, and concepts inherent in the case setting by encouraging them to submit questions from diverse perspectives, utilising the numerous information resources available. In support, Panaoura's (2021) study indicated that parental involvement significantly enhances learner achievement, particularly in understanding economic concepts (Singh et al., 2022). Likewise, a study by Adu and Zondo (2022) found that parental involvement in economics homework and academic endeavours significantly enhanced learner performance among Ghanaian senior high school students.

2.2.3 Teacher and learner motivation

The motivation of educators and learners is essential in determining academic outcomes and overall educational success (De Loof, Struyf, Boeve-de Pauw, & Van Petegem, 2019). A study by Christian and Sayed (2023) revealed a significant influence of teacher motivation on learner engagement, academic performance, and teacher efficacy. Conversely, unmotivated teachers can negatively impact learner performance (Paais & Pattiruhu, 2020). Suárez-Mesa and Gómez (2024) contend that educators must positively engage their learners by encouraging participation in classroom activities. Motivation serves as an excellent mechanism for assisting both prospective and practising educators in cultivating a sense of ethical duty and comprehending the contextual nature of teaching through analytical and critical thought. According to De Loof et al. (2019), when motivation increases, learners transition from a novice status to adopting a professional perspective within the discipline. A study by Buckles et al. (2013) found that motivated teachers positively impacted learner performance in economics. Conversely, unmotivated teachers can negatively impact learner performance (Paais & Pattiruhu, 2020). In economics education, motivation serves as a mechanism for assisting educators in cultivating a sense of ethical duty and comprehending the contextual nature of teaching (De Loof et al., 2019).

2.2.4 Lesson preparation

The effective design of lessons is a crucial factor influencing teaching quality and learner results (Strong, 2021). Krepf and König (2022) found that effective lesson preparation enables educators to articulate learning objectives, select suitable instructional strategies, and assess learner understanding (Amalia et al., 2020). Insufficient class preparation could lead to reduced learner motivation, increased instructor stress, and worse academic performance (Farhang, Hashemi, & Ghorianfar, 2023). Farhang et al. (2023) maintain that lesson planning assists educators in addressing daily classroom issues. Planning allows educators to evaluate how to address learners who have made inappropriate remarks without alienating them for the remainder of the lesson; how to regulate their emotional responses to objectionable comments; and how to determine the most suitable moment to defer the discussion and reflect on a response outside of class. Amalia et al. (2020) contend that educators must strategise for instructional scenarios to ensure learners acquire elevated degrees of information, abilities, and favourable attitudes. Krepf and König (2022) discovered that effective lesson preparation enables educators to articulate learning objectives, select suitable instructional

strategies, and assess learner understanding of economics. Similarly, Amalia et al. (2020) offer that educators must strategise for instructional scenarios to ensure learners acquire elevated degrees of information, abilities, and favourable attitudes towards economics.

3. Theoretical Framework

This study adopted critical emancipatory research (CER) as a framework to articulate the researcher's perspective on interactions with the participants throughout the research process (Noel, 2016). CER aligns with the PAR methodology employed in this study, namely advancing social justice by establishing settings that enhance empowerment (Pillay, 2018; MacDonald, 2012). The decision to utilise CER was guided by the framework's aim to involve the marginalised, ensuring their perspectives are acknowledged and valued (Nkoane, 2012). The decision is supported by Dube and Hlalele (2018) who assert that CER can alter the status quo, address inequities and alienation, and foster emancipation. Moreover, it promotes the cause of human liberation irrespective of rank and endeavours to achieve peace, freedom, hope, social justice, and equity in all its manifestations (Mahlomaholo, 2009).

Schudel (2022) posits that CER as a framework facilitates the comprehension of emancipation as a procedural act, justifiable across diverse cultural and moral contexts, without dictating the material form that emancipation may or should assume (Bobbo, Ius, & Rigoni, 2024). Emancipation was thus regarded as a commendable aim of study that validated the researcher's purpose. The engaging character of CER facilitated a profound understanding and the consideration of many perspectives in the study (Ndaba & Dube, 2021), aiding participants in comprehending the obstacles encountered in establishing sustainable rural learning ecologies. Moreover, the empowering and transformative agenda of CER (Daire, Carlson et al., 2023) enabled the study's participants to take ownership of the problem and process, provide solutions to the challenge, and establish the necessary conditions for the solutions to be effective. It enabled them to recognise potential hazards and subsequently adopt strategies to mitigate them as part of altering their circumstances (Mofoka & Mokhampanyane, 2024). Furthermore, CER facilitated the inclusion of marginalised stakeholders, providing them with opportunities to engage within the established frameworks of the school and comprehend classroom practices (Bhebhe & Ngoepe, 2021), as well as the political, social, and economic issues that underpin their social environment (Bobbo et al., 2024). In this study, the application of CER signified a dedication to improving relationships and fostering a more equitable society, hence confronting social imbalances and injustices present in schools to alter the existing paradigm (Daire et al., 2023).

4. Method

4.1 Research paradigm

The study was grounded in the interpretivist paradigm, which emphasises the subjective nature of reality and the importance of understanding multiple perspectives (Creswell, 2014). Interpretivism acknowledges that knowledge is constructed through social interactions and context (Schwandt, 2007). In the

context of this study, the interpretivist paradigm allowed for an in-depth exploration of the complex social dynamics influencing teaching and learning economics, aligning well with the use of CER. First, CER is grounded in distinct philosophical assumptions that guide the research process. These assumptions enabled the researcher to select the interpretivist research paradigm for this study. Second, CER posits that social reality is constructed through human interactions, relationships, and power dynamics (Berger & Luckmann, 1966). This assumption aligns with interpretivism's focus on understanding subjective reality and multiple perspectives. Finally, CER also recognises that knowledge is contextual, power-dependent, and influenced by social, cultural, and historical factors (Foucault, 1980). Interpretivism's emphasis on contextual understanding and subjective knowledge resonates with this epistemological stance.

4.2 Research approach

This research utilised a qualitative methodology. The qualitative technique was appropriate since it enabled the researcher to understand participants' reality through the collection and analysis of data, thereby clarifying the importance of important themes in their life experiences (Keahey, 2021; Puri, 2023). A qualitative research approach further enabled the researcher to capture the nuanced perspectives and experiences of educators and learners (Keahey, 2021). Qualitative methods facilitated contextual understanding through data collection in natural settings (Puri, 2023). The adoption of the qualitative method for this paper facilitated the in-depth and rich data collection from economics teachers and learners in their natural settings (units) where social learning occurs (White, 2022). As Kelly (2023) notes, qualitative research enables researchers to explore the sociocultural, historical, and situational contexts surrounding phenomena. Pillay (2018) asserts that this approach demands an interpretation of reality from the participants' perspective, necessitating their precise articulation of events, emotions, and behaviours. By utilising this methodology, the researcher sought to obtain precise and thorough representations of the behaviours, events, and processes of the teachers and learners being examined (White, 2022).

4.3 Research design

The study adopted a Participatory Action Research (PAR) framework with a case study format. A case study was deemed suitable for the extensive examination of the subject within its real-life context while enabling both the participants and researcher to explore improved, liberating, less alienating, and more emancipatory methods for initiating and promoting change for marginalised individuals (Fornari & Fonseca, 2023). Using PAC as the theoretical framework provided a comprehensive approach to collaborative inquiry, contextual relevance, and empowerment through participatory methods (Keahey, 2021). According to Puri (2023), PAR involves cycles of planning, action, and reflection, ensuring that research is grounded in practice. This design enables co-researchers to take an active role in identifying the conditions conducive to sustainable learning in economics using PAR (Pillay, 2018). The fundamental idea is that those most impacted by a problem will be directly engaged in the design and execution of research about that topic (Padayachee et al., 2023). PAR was suitable for the study as it facilitated immersion in the context of teaching and learning economics

by engaging co-researchers in identifying pertinent difficulties and collaboratively devising solutions through empowerment. The study team conducted focus group discussions (FGDs) as a method of data generation through critical engagement in discourse. The purpose of the FGDs was to critically examine PAR as a catalyst for fostering conditions favourable to sustained learning in economics.

4.4 Selection of participants

The participants for this study were selected using a purposive sampling technique. This type of sampling is used when the researcher is looking for a specific type of participant or when the sample size is small and the goal is to maximise the information obtained from the participants. Purposive sampling aided in selecting participants who possessed a deep familiarity with the context under examination and were likely to offer valuable responses to the researcher's inquiries. This approach guaranteed that the chosen information was both substantial and pertinent to the research. The study involved 10 participants examining PAR as a catalyst for fostering conditions conducive to sustainable learning in economics at a selected high secondary school in the Free State Province, Thabo-Mofutsanyane Education District, South Africa. The participants included three teachers, three learners, and four other stakeholders such as members of the school management team (SMT), subject advisor (LF), and representative council of learners (RCL). A sample size of 10 participants was deemed sufficient for this study based on the saturation point. Research suggests that a saturation point is typically reached with 5-10 participants in qualitative studies (Guest et al., 2017). The Free Attitude Interview (FAI) methodology used required an in-depth exploration of participants' attitudes and experiences, making a smaller sample size more manageable. Time and resource limitations also influenced the sample size. Table 1 delineates the characteristics of the participants regarding affiliation, gender, and age.

Table 1: Profiles of the participants

Affiliation Gender Age

Pseudonym	Affiliation	Gender	Age	Grade/Subject
Lemza (Teacher)	HoD-BCM	Male	40-45	Economics
Gloria (Teacher)	Senior teacher- Econ	Female	55-60	Economics
Alice (Teacher)	PL1-Economics	Female	40-45	Economics
Tshepo (Lecturer)	Economics Education	Male	40-45	Economics
Mdu (LF)	LF-Economics	Male	55-60	Economics
Boka (Facilitator)	Kagiso-Trust	Female	40-45	Accounting
Hlaps (RCL)	RCL President	Male	17-18	Grade 12
Mpho (Learner)	Grade 10 Economics	Males	15-16	Grade 10
Thiza (Learner)	Grade 11 Economics	Female	16-17	Grade 11
Siza (Learner)	Grade 12 Economics	Female	17-18	Grade 12

Informed consent was acquired from the participants. They were also informed of their right to withdraw from the study at any time. The participants were assured that all information shared would remain confidential. Additionally, they were ensured that the data would be utilised exclusively to understand the conditions conducive for teaching and learning of economics. Pseudonyms were employed to safeguard the participants' identities.

4.5 Data generation

The researcher employed the Free Attitude Interview (FAI) methodology as advocated by Meulenberg-Buskens (2003), in contrast to scenarios where individuals answer pre-established questions. The FAI is a semi-structured, openended, and non-directive interviewing technique that allows respondents to express their thoughts, feelings, and attitudes freely, without predetermined questions or categories. This strategy enabled the researcher to establish a personal rapport and communication with the participants and the broader society (Julia 2014). In the FAI, participants engaged in a conventional dialogue. The technique was employed innovatively and as a tool for data collecting, incorporating components of respect for individuals, with the inquiry serving solely as a catalyst for dialogue. The researcher was obligated to honour the participants' perspectives and demonstrate engagement by permitting them to articulate their emotions. The FAI is inherently non-directive, facilitating participants' engagement in addressing matters of consistency and validity (Omodan, Tsotetsi, & Dube, 2019). Therefore, the FAI permitted the researcher to practice reflexivity to mitigate the influence of preconceived notions on the study process (Nyumba, Wilson, Derrick, & Mukherjee, 2018). The researcher conducted monthly meetings over three months and bi-weekly focus group talks (Nyumba et al., 2018). Prolonged interview sessions were used to validate the results.

During FAIs, participants are encouraged to share their thoughts freely, without predetermined categories or questions. This allows researchers to identify potential issues with question clarity, relevance, and comprehensiveness. Thus, an audio recorder was used (with permission) to record participants' responses and establish the study's credibility and authenticity, in addition to verbatim transcriptions from audio recordings. Cognitive Interviewing Theory (CIT) supports FAI as an effective method for validating data collection instruments. Using meetings and focus group discussions, the researcher successfully obtained comprehensive, contextualised data and arrived at informed conclusions. The entire group engaged as co-researchers and supported each other in overcoming challenges. Numerous gatherings were audio recorded and subsequently transcribed into text. According to Mavhandu-Mudzusi (2018), triangulation in a study is accomplished by cross-validating data from focus group discussions and additional sources, including meetings. For this study, triangulation was achieved during meetings and focus groups by employing methods such as note-taking, audio recordings, and transcription to guarantee precision.

4.6 Data analysis

The study employed the Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) method, which Van Dijk (2009) characterises as focusing on the discourse aspects of power abuse and the ensuing injustice and inequality. Fairclough (2003) roughly defines CDA as a methodology that amalgamates language analysis with social theory. CDA emphasises domination and inequality, indicating that, in contrast to other areas or methodologies in discourse analysis, it is chiefly concerned with and driven by urgent social issues, which it seeks to elucidate through discourse analysis. The selection of CDA was guided by CER's aim to involve the marginalised, ensuring

their opinions are acknowledged and valued (Van Dijk, 2009). Mogashoa (2014) posits that discourse is both shaped by and shapes the social context, institutions, and structures in which it occurs and is interconnected. According to Krueger and Casey (2021), a discourse is culturally binding and, therefore, selective. CDA analysts extend their work beyond mere description and interpretation of discourse to engage in discussions on social issues, aiming to contribute to societal advancement (Van Dijk, 2009). Therefore, the content was examined on two levels. First, on the fundamental level of analysis, which is a descriptive representation of the data: it reflects precisely what was articulated without any interpretation or assumptions. Second, on the elevated degree of analysis that was interpretative, focusing on the meanings attributed by the subjects of the research, as well as the inferences or implications drawn. It is occasionally referred to as the latent level of analysis (Rahimi & Riasati, 2011).

5. Findings

5.1 Collaborative learning

The literature indicated that parents, teachers, and learners must interact to identify concerns, challenges, and concepts inherent in the educational environment and to raise inquiries regarding inequalities common within the school system (Warsah et al., 2021). Ariani and Valiantien (2022) contend that collaborative teaching and learning provide teachers and learners with the time and opportunity to vocally exchange ideas and explore economic issues together. This finding was confirmed by Boka who responded:

"For the learners to perform well and understand what is being taught in the classroom they have to work in groups, they help one another where they are unclear on the work done in class."

Gloria supported Boka's view:

"I fully agree with what Boka is saying because I have observed that most of the learners who remain after school, helping one another with their work are likely to succeed in their academic issues."

Both participants concurred that collaborative learning enhances academic performance and that learners significantly benefit from peer-led group discussions. They further agreed that clear and straightforward explanations provided to those who struggle to comprehend the teacher's instruction also contributed. This concept should be executed not solely by learners. Educators must also participate in their instruction to exchange effective teaching ideas and enhance outcomes. Similarly, Anwar et al. (2021) assert that in a learning environment, learners engage, support one another with academic work, and foster one another's success. Therefore, learners must be afforded time and opportunity to engage in verbal exchanges and debate the relevant concepts.

5.2 Parental involvement

The literature indicated that educators should not underestimate the extensive knowledge parents possess, as it can enhance learners' comprehension (Kartel, Charles, Xiao, & Sundi, 2022). If parents are perceived as indifferent to their children's well-being, they are unlikely to prioritise their education. This finding was supported by Alice's comment:

"We spent most of our time dealing with learners' ill behaviour. Parents do not take part in assisting the school to deal with bad behaviour in the school."

Mdu had the following to say:

"I think parents want to take part in the education of our children, but the school does not inform us about the behaviour of our children, and meetings are not convened continuously where the parents get an explanation regarding their children's behaviour."

The two parties appeared to disagree over the inclusion of parents in their children's education. Seemingly, the educators attribute the learners' behaviour to parental negligence, whereas the parents contend that the school fails to include them in sessions for clarification. Jacobs (2024) maintains that parental involvement in children's education is essential for identifying issues, problems, and concepts inherent in the case environment by encouraging them to pose questions from diverse perspectives and utilising various informational resources. The situation is unfavourable for enhancing the learner's scholarly achievement. A comprehensive program must be presented to parents regarding school activities, such as the monitoring of learners' books and the gathering of reports, among others. The principal is responsible for educating parents about their roles.

5.3 Teacher and learner motivation

The literature indicated that educators must positively engage their learners by encouraging participation in classroom activities. Motivation serves as a potent mechanism for assisting both prospective and current educators in cultivating a sense of ethical duty and comprehending the contextual nature of teaching through analytical and critical reflections (Suárez-Mesa & Gómez, 2024). Mpho commented:

"Some teachers are negative, they are unable to motivate learners."

Thiza supported Mpho's comment:

"I do not dispute that we are failing but to be told that we are dumb is not good at all because it's not our fault, we would have not gone to school if we did not want to learn."

However, Lemza iterated:

"Our learners are not motivated, they cannot work on their own, we always run after them regarding submission of their school work, some of them don't even bother writing the tasks, so they expect us to be silent and not say anything, no! I cannot be controlled by learners."

The participants indicated that both teachers' and learners' attitudes are unfavourable towards their work. Learners are reluctant to assume responsibility for their academic assignments. Educators ought to demonstrate to their learners the significance of learning rather than assuming that all concepts are self-evident. Occasionally, learners are oblivious to the consequences, both positive and negative, of neglecting their academic responsibilities. Motivation is a

fundamental component of academic achievement in educational institutions. When both educators and learners are motivated, they will fulfil their responsibilities effectively. This approach is supported by De Loof et al. (2019), who contend that when motivation increases, learners transition from novice status to adopting a professional viewpoint within the subject. Motivation must be fostered within the educational institution, such as through morning devotions and awards.

5.4 Lesson preparation

The literature indicated that educators must strategise teaching-learning scenarios to ensure learners acquire elevated levels of information, abilities, and positive attitudes (Amalia et al., 2020). Siza's comment supported this notion:

"When we ask questions in class the teacher is not in a position to explain to us, you will find him teaching the national aggregates unable to arrive at correct answers as in the memo. Again when we have practiced the previous question papers, as we ask him questions while knowing answers, he does not give us the correct ones."

Mpho added:

"I even remember Mr...who taught us before, he knows his story that person."

Mdu interrupted:

"The learners' problem is that they do not prepare before coming to class, they expect to get everything from the teacher."

Hlabs responded:

"I understand but the teachers are the ones who are supposed to teach us and we study. There are still other teachers who come to class not prepared, so it is the same."

Tshepo interjected:

"Wait! Let us not point fingers at one another and provide a solution, the school is ours, we have to improve it."

The participants' remarks indicated a tendency to assign blame and a reluctance to accept accountability for their lack of preparation prior to attending class. Educators attribute fault to the learners, but the learners likewise assign blame to their educators. Effective planning enables learners to recognise issues and devise solutions through creative and imaginative thinking in real-world contexts (Nazeef et al., 2024). This is demonstrated by the remark (Butleng.../Wait...). To enhance academic achievement, it is essential that both teachers and learners arrive prepared for the classroom.

6. Discussion of Findings

The study's findings indicated that learners should engage in collaborative groups and are anticipated to converse, inquire, learn, and answer during the sessions. A teacher should assist the learning process, which is predominantly learner-centred, problem-based, and self-directed. The teacher's function ought to be that of a facilitator; yet, it may be inferred that the diverse teaching and learning styles

of learners are overlooked in the classroom. According to Ariani and Valiantien (2022) parents, educators, and learners must collaborate to recognise concerns, challenges, and concepts inherent in the educational environment, as well as to interrogate injustices common within the school system. Empirical research consistently demonstrated that collaborative learning enhances learner performance in STEM disciplines (Ramdani & Susilo, 2022) and cultivates vital soft skills, such as communication, cooperation, and problem-solving (Anwar et al., 2021). Furthermore, a study conducted by Nazeef et al. (2024), found that collaborative learning enhances social inclusion and accommodates varied learning requirements, especially for individuals with impairments. In another study, Warsah et al. (2021) underscored the beneficial effects of collaborative learning on critical thinking, creativity, learner happiness, and engagement.

The study revealed that policies concerning parental involvement in schools are disregarded, compelling parents to adopt and execute the master's perceived best practices for them. Their abilities and expertise are scrutinised and considered essential for enhancing and favourably impacting their children's education (Wilke, 2022). Jacobs (2024) asserts that parental involvement in their children's education is essential for identifying concerns, challenges, and concepts inherent in the teaching and learning environment by encouraging them to raise inquiries from many perspectives, utilising the array of information resources available. Empirical research indicated that parental participation is positively connected with enhanced learner academic success, including elevated grades and standardised test scores (Mbhiza and Nkambule, 2023). Research has emphasised the significance of parental involvement in enhancing learner engagement and motivation, especially among impoverished communities (Myende & Nhlumayo, 2020). Moreover, several studies have underscored the influence of parental engagement on teacher-learner relationships, indicating that such involvement fosters more pleasant and supportive interactions (Gubbins & Otero, 2020).

The study revealed a lack of motivation among both teachers and learners, as indicated by the prevalence of teacher absenteeism and truancy. Educators neither hold supplementary classes for their learners nor engage in extracurricular activities. Furthermore, real-world situations link information to learners' experiences and enhance their understanding of subjects as essential for practical application in their lives (Paais & Pattiruhu, 2020). Thus, Suárez-Mesa and Gómez (2024) contend that educators must positively engage their learners by encouraging participation in classroom activities. Motivation serves as an excellent mechanism for assisting both prospective and practising educators in cultivating a sense of ethical duty and comprehending the contextual nature of teaching through analytical and critical thought. Empirical research indicated a positive correlation between teacher motivation and both learner engagement and academic achievement, with autonomous motivation serving as a significant predictor of teacher effectiveness (Christian & Sayed, 2023). Furthermore, studies demonstrated that learner motivation is affected by instructor feedback, with constructive feedback enhancing intrinsic motivation and self-efficacy among learners (Kalyar, Ahmed, & Kalyar, 2018). Furthermore, research has underscored the influence of gamification and game-based learning on learner motivation,

revealing notable enhancements in engagement and enjoyment (Zhang & Liu, 2019).

The research revealed that both educators and learners must arrive in class adequately prepared. Lesson planning is crucial as it enables teachers to manage classroom dynamics (Khan, Siraj, & Ilyas, 2024). Amalia et al. (2020) propose that lesson planning assists educators in addressing daily classroom issues. Planning allows educators to assess how to address learners who made inappropriate remarks without alienating them for the remainder of the lesson; how to regulate their own emotional responses to objectionable comments; and how to determine the most suitable moment to postpone the discussion and reflect on a response outside of class. Empirical research indicated that comprehensive lesson preparation is favourably associated with heightened learner involvement, academic success, and teacher confidence (Krepf & König, 2022). Furthermore, studies found that lesson preparation is essential for enhancing teacher clarity, organisation, and classroom management, resulting in better learning outcomes (Manzoor et al., 2024). Research also highlighted the significance of lesson preparation in facilitating differentiated instruction, as prepared educators are more inclined to customise their teaching to address varied learner requirements (Farhang et al., 2023). Importantly, class preparation correlates with less teacher stress and burnout, alongside enhanced job satisfaction (Amalia et al., 2020).

7. Ethical Considerations

In compliance with ethical requirements, authorisation was obtained from the Free State Department of Education and the University of the Free State to conduct this research project at designated schools (ethical clearance number UFS-EDU-2012-0027). The participants were guaranteed that their identities would remain confidential and that participation in the study was entirely voluntary. Informed consent was secured from the participants, and the collected data was stored securely to be destroyed at the conclusion of the study.

8. Limitations

This study was limited to a single school within the Thabo-Mofutsanyane Education District. The study aimed not to deliver a generic outcome but to identify and specify the pathways that participants might utilise to alleviate issues associated with LAP in their educational environment. To mitigate the aforementioned constraint, the study must involve a larger participant pool and encompass multiple schools. It is recommended that a similar study with an alternative design and methodology, as this study was framed under PAR should be conducted.

9. Contribution of the Study

This study contributes to the current body of knowledge by employing PAR as a catalyst to foster conditions favourable for sustainable learning in economics. The conclusions will empower various stakeholders including the Thabo-Mofutsanyane Education District, educators, learners, and parents in collaborating to establish conditions that facilitate effective economics instruction and learning.

10. Conclusion and Recommendations

This study set out to explore the potential of participatory action research (PAR) as a catalyst for enabling conditions conducive to sustainable learning in economics, focusing on the experiences of secondary school learners and teachers in Thabo-Mofutsanyane Education District. In contrast to conventional research, where specialists formulate questions and interpret results, PAR enabled the researcher to prioritise collaboration with the subjects thereby empowering them to tackle community challenges. The findings emphasised that collaborative learning, parental participation, motivated educators and learners, and lesson preparation are essential prerequisites for sustained learning in economics. In addition, the results of the study suggested that students should participate in collaborative groups where they are expected to communicate, ask questions, learn, and respond during the sessions. The research also revealed that the issue of policies concerning parental involvement in schools is disregarded, compelling parents to adopt and implement what they believe to be the most effective practices for their children. Considering this, this study advocates for the active engagement of schools and educators in fostering a collaborative and supportive classroom environment, motivating both instructors and learners, preparing lessons effectively, and boosting parental involvement in the educational process to increase sustainable learning.

11. References

- Adu, E. O., & Zondo, S. S. (2022). Chronicling teacher's experiences in the teaching of economics in the Covid-19 Era. *International Journal of Research in Business & Social Science (IJRBS)*, 11(8), 290-297. https://doi.org/10.20525/ijrbs.v11i8.2078
- Adu, E. O., & Zondo, S. S. (2023). Exploring teachers' perspectives on the relevance of teaching economics management sciences in schools. *Universal Journal of Education Research*, 11(3), 57-66. https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer:2023.110303
- Alejandra, B., & Walker, M. (2020). "Potential of PAR Processes to Overcome Epistemic Injustice in Non-Ideal University Settings." In Walker, M. and Boni, A. (Eds), Participatory Research, Capabilities and Epistemic Justice: A Transformative Agenda for Higher Education (pp. 243-59). Cham, CH: Palgrave Macmillan. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-56197-0_10
- Amalia, L. L., Widiati, U., Basthomi, Y., & Cahyono, B. Y. (2020). Reflective practice on lesson planning among EFL teacher educators. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 10(1), 153-160. https://doi.org/10.17509/IJAL.V10I1.25025
- Amartey, A., & Yalley, C. (2020). Economics learners' perception of Economic teachers' effective instructional practices in the senior high schools in the Cape Coast Metropolis. *Journal of Educational and Psychological Research*, 2(2), 63-73.
- Anwar, K., Ansari, S., Husniah, R., & Asmara, C. H. (2021). learners' Perceptions of Collaborative Team Teaching and learner Achievement Motivation. *International Journal of Instruction*, 14(1), 325-344. https://doi.org/10.29333/iji/1079
- Ariani, S., & Valiantien, N. M. (2022). Collaborative Learning for Enhancing learner Academic Achievement in Online Grammar Class: an Experimental Study. *Journal of English as A Foreign Language Teaching and Research*, 2(1), 50-58.
- Bhebhe, S., & Ngoepe, M. (2021). Elitism in critical emancipatory paradigm: National archival oral history collection in Zimbabwe and South Africa. *Archival Science*, 21(2), 155-172. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10502-020-09351-y

- Bendien, E., Groot, B., & Abma T. (2022). Circles of impacts within and beyond PAR with older people. *Ageing and Society*, 42(5):1014-1034. https://10.1017/S0144686X20001336
- Christian, D., & Sayed Y. (2023). Teacher Motivation to Teach in Challenging School Contexts on the Cape Flats, Western Cape, South Africa. *Education Sciences*, 13(2), 165. https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci13020165
- Daire, A. P., Carlson, R. G., & Pointer, A. (2023). Emancipatory approaches in couples' intervention research. *Family Process*, 62, 899-914. https://doi.org/10.1111/famp.12890
- Davis, C., & Luke, P. (2021). Learner-Staff Partnerships at Work: Epistemic Confidence, Research-Engaged Teaching and Vocational Learning in the Transition to Higher Education. *Educational Action Research*, 29(2), 292-309. https://doi.org/10.1080/09650792.2020.1792958.
- De Loof, H., Struyf, A., Boeve-de Pauw, J., & Van Petegem, P. (2019). *Teachers' motivating style and learners' motivation and engagement in STEM: The relationship between Three Key educational concepts. Research in Science Education. Res Sci Educ, 51*(1), 109-127. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11165-019-9830-3
- Dube, B., & Hlalele, D. (2018). Revisiting critical emancipatory research in school violence narratives. A quest for a safe school. *Educational Research for Social Change*, 8(4), 74-86. https://doi.org/10.17159/2221-4070/2018/v8i4a5
- Dusty, C. E. (2024). The transformative power of action research. *Educational Action Research*, 32(2), 165–168. https://doi.org/10.1080/09650792.2024.2321728
- Fairclough, N. 2003. *Analysis of discourse: Textual analysis for social research*. Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203694345
- Farhang, A., Hashemi, A. P. S. S. A., & Ghorianfar, A. P. S. M. (2023). Lesson plan and its importance in teaching process. *International Journal of Current Science Research and Review*, 6(8). https://doi.org/10.47191/ijcsrr/v6-i8-57
- Fornari, L. F., & Fonseca, R. M. G. S. D. (2023). Critical-emancipatory educational intervention through games to face gender violence. *Rev Bras Enferm*, 76(2), e20220299. https://10.1590/0034-7167-2022-0299.
- Gubbins, V., & Otero, G. (2020). Parental involvement and low-SES children's academic achievement in early elementary school: New evidence from Chile. *Educational Studies*, 46(5), 548–569. https://doi.org/10.1080/03055698.2019.1620691
- Hamilton, A., Morgan, S., Murphy, B., & Harland, K. (2024). *Taking boys seriously: Utilising PAR to tackle compounded educational disadvantage.* Action Research. Advance online publication. https://doi.org/10.1177/14767503241226894
- Jacobs, C. (2023). Parental educational support to adolescents: Exploring the role of emotional capital in low-income single-mother families in South Africa. South African Journal of Education 43(2), 2217. https://doi.org/10.15700/saje.v43n2a2217
- Jacobs, C. (2024). Re-imagining a framework for parent involvement in South Africa: Preparing preservice teachers. *South African Journal of Childhood Education* 14(1), a1431. https://doi.org/10.4102/sajce.v14i1.1431
- Kartel, A., Charles, M., Xiao, H., & Sundi, D. (2022). Strategies for Parent Involvement During Distance Learning in Arabic Lessons in Elementary Schools. *Journal International of Lingua and Technology*, 1(2), 99-113. https://doi.org/10.55849/jiltech.v1i2.82
- Kalyar, M., Ahmad, B., & Kalyar, H. (2018). Does teacher motivation lead to learner motivation? The mediating role of teaching behavior. *Voprosy Educational Studies Moscow*, 15(3), 91–119. https://doi.org/10.17323/1814-9545-2018-3-91-119
- Keahey, J. (2021). Sustainable Development and Participatory Action Research: A Systematic Review. Systemic Practice and Action Research, 34(3), 291-306.

- https://doi.org/10.1007/s11213-020-09535-8
- Khan, S., Siraj, D., & Ilyas, Z. (2024). Effect of Lesson Planning on Academic Performance: Evidence from the Elementary Level Classroom. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 8(1), 169–177. https://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2024(8-I)15
- Kim, H. R. (2020). The relationship between intrinsic motivation and learning outcomes in problem-based learning. *The Journal of Korean Academic Society of Nursing Education*, 26(3), 238–247. https://doi.org/10.5977/jkasne.2020.26.3. 238
- Krepf, M., & König, J. (2022). Structuring the lesson: an empirical investigation of preservice teacher decision-making during the planning of a demonstration lesson. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 49(5), 911–926. https://doi.org/10.1080/02607476.2022.2151877
- MacDonald, C. (2012). Understanding PAR: A qualitative research methodology option. *Canadian Journal of Action Research*, 13, 34-50. https://doi.org/10.33524/cjar.v13i2.37
- Mahlomaholo, M. G. (2009). Critical emancipatory research and academic identity. *Africa Education Review*, 6(2), 224-237. https://doi.org/10.1080/18146620903274555
- Manzoor, A. A., Tufal, N., & Hayat, K. (2024). Exploring the Role of Lesson Planning on Prospective Teacher Professional Skills at the University of Narowal: A Qualitative Research Study. *Quantic Journal of Social Sciences*, 5(2), 66-75. https://doi.org/10.55737/qjss.349976385
- Mavhandu-Mudzusi, A. H. (2018). The couple interview as a method of collecting data in interpretative phenomenological analysis studies. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 17(1). https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406917750994
- Meulenberg-Buskens, I. (2003). Free attitude interview technique. Unpublished notes.
- Melo, V. (2019). Emancipatory Education and Youth Engagement in Brazil: A Study Bridging the Theory and Practice of Education for Social Transformation. *Education Sciences* 9(23), 1-14. https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci9010023
- Mizzi, E. (2022) Powerful knowledge and pedagogy in the Maltese secondary school economics classroom. [Unpublished doctoral thesis]. Institute of Education: University College London.
- Mizzi, E. (2023) Infusing Sustainability in Secondary School Economics Education. *International Journal for Business Education*, 165(1), 1–14. https://doi.org/10.30707/IJBE165.1.1681910081.978263
- Mizzi, E. (2024). Pedagogical content knowledge in school economics. *Citizenship, Social and Economics Education*, 0(0). https://doi.org/10.1177/14788047241276192
- Mofoka , J. G., & Mokhampanyane, M. (2024). Potential threats to implementing instructional leadership in Western Cape township secondary schools. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Education Research*, 6(33), 1-16. https://doi.org/10.38140/ijer-2024.vol6.33
- Mogashoa, T. (2014). Understanding critical discourse analysis in qualitative research. *International Journal of Humanities, Social Sciences and Education, 1*(7), 104-113. https://doi.org/10.5958/2321-4777.1.7.016
- Mundelsee, L., & Jurkowski, S. (2021). Think and pair before share: Effects of collaboration on learners' in-class participation. *Learning and Individual Differences, 88,* 102015. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lindif.2021.102015
- Nazeef, N. M., khan, A., & Ali, J. (2024). Impact of Collaborative Learning on learner's Academic Performance in Teacher's Education Program. *Journal of Asian Development Studies*, 13(1), 1054-1068. https://doi.org/10.62345/jads.2024.13.1.87
- Ndaba, X., & Dube, B. (2021). Critical Emancipatory Research Approach to Enhance Performance Among Progressed Learners in Life Sciences. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 12(53). 10.36941/mjss-2021-0027

- Nkoane, M. M. (2012). Critical Emancipatory Research for Social Justice and Democratic Citizenship. *Perspectives in Education*, 30(4), 98–104. https://journals.ufs.ac.za/index.php/pie/article/view/1786(Accessed 04 September 2021.)
- Noel, L. (2016). Promoting an emancipatory research paradigm in design education and practice. In Proceedings of the Design Research Society Conference (pp. 1-16). https://dl.designresearchsociety.org/drspapers/drs2016/researchpapers/157/
- Nyumba, T., Wilson, K., Derrick, C. J., & Mukherjee, N. (2018). The use of focus group discussion methodology: Insights from two decades of application in conservation. *Methods in Ecology and Evolution*, 9(1), 20-32. https://doi.org/10.1111/2041-210X.12860
- Omodan, B. I., Tsotetsi, C. T., & Dube, B. (2019). Decolonising the Rural-Urban Dichotomy in South Africa: An Asset-Based Approach. *Progressio*, 41(1), 17. https://doi.org/10.25159/2663-5895/5665
- Padayachee, K., Maistry, S., Harris, G.T., & Lortan, D. (2023). Integral education and Ubuntu: A PAR project in South Africa. *South African Journal of Childhood Education*, 13(1), a1298. https://doi.org/10.4102/sajce.v13i1.1298
- Palka, J. (2024). Participatory and Place-Based Socioeconomic Knowledge Generation: An Experience in Community-Based Research Pedagogy. *Teaching and Learning Inquiry*, 12(3), 1–26. https://doi.org/10.20343/teachlearninqu.12.8.
- Panaoura, R. (2021). Parental Involvement in Children's Mathematics Learning Before and During the Period of the Covid-19. *Social Education Research*, 65–74. https://doi.org/10.37256/ser.212021547.
- Pillay, A. (2018). Enabling Agency through PAR in an Honours-Level Postgraduate Class in a School of Education. *South African Journal of Higher Education*, 32(6), 469-82. https://doi.org/10.20853/32-6-2940.
- Puri, G. (2023). PAR in Social Sciences and Education. *Journal of NELTA Gandaki*, vi(1&2), 66-77. https://doi.org/10.3126/long.v6i1-2.59713
- Rahimi, F., & Riasati, M. J. (2011). Critical Discourse analysis: Scrutinising ideologically driven discourses. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 1(46), 107-112.
- Ramdani, D., & Susilo, H. (2022). The Effectiveness of Collaborative Learning on Critical Thinking, Creative Thinking, and Metacognitive Skill Ability: Meta-Analysis on Biological Learning. *European Journal of Educational Research*, 11(3), 1607-1628. https://doi.org/0.12973/eu-jer.11.3.1607
- Schudel, I. (2022). A critical realist (re-)envisaging of emancipatory research, science and practice. Journal of Critical Realism, 21(5), 477–482. https://doi.org/10.1080/14767430.2022.2151142
- Simweleba, N. H., & Serpell, R. (2020). Parental Involvement and Learners' Performance in Rural Basic Schools of Zambia. *South African Journal of Childhood Education*, 10(1), a608. Available at: https://doi.org/10.4102/sace.v10i1.608 (Accessed 30 August 2021.
- Shanks, N. (2020) "Starting points matter": Humanizing economics pedagogy through new economic paradigms. *The Social Studies*, 111(6), 296–311. https://doi.org/10.1080/00377996.2020.1747104
- Singh, K.A., Banerjee, S., & Bandyopadhyay, K. (2022). Community involvement in controlling COVID-19 pandemic in Maharashtra, India: best practices and missed opportunities. *Med*J,

 15,

 309–312. https://doi.org/10.4103/mjdrdypu.mjdrdypu_125_21

- Spencer, L., Leonard, N., Jessiman, P., Kaluževičiūtė-Moreton, G., Limmer, M., & Kidger, J. (2024). Exploring the feasibility of using Participatory Action Research (PAR) as a mechanism for school culture change to improve mental health. *Pastoral Care in Education*, 1–19. https://doi.org/10.1080/02643944.2024.2323134
- Strong, M. (2021). The Art of Lesson Planning: Strategies for Effective Teaching. Routledge.
- Suárez-Mesa, A. M., Gómez, R.L. (2024). Does teachers' motivation have an impact on learners' scientific literacy and motivation? An empirical study in Colombia with data from PISA 2015. *Large-scale Assess Educ* 12, 1. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40536-023-00190-8
- Van Dijk, T. A. (2009). Critical Discourse Studies. A Socio-cognitive Approach. In Wodak, R. and Meyer, M. (Eds.), Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis. Sage.
- Warsah, I., Morganna, R., Uyun, M., & Afandi, M. (2021) The Impact of Collaborative Learning on Learners' Critical Thinking Skills. *International Journal of Instruction*,14(2), 443-460. https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2021.14227
- White, C. (2022) PAR Addressing Social Mobility. Open *Journal of Social Sciences*, 10, 269-283. https://doi.org/10.4236/jss.2022.106021.
- Wilke, J. (2022). *Teacher perspectives on the role of parental educational support of English second-language learners*. Unpublished master's thesis, Stellenbosch University.
- Zhang, S., & Liu, Q. (2019). Investigating the relationships among teachers' motivational beliefs, motivational regulation, and their learning engagement in online professional learning communities. *Computers & Education*, 134, 145-155. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2019.02.013