

Discipline Based Art Education as an Approach to Art Instruction: The Case of Standard Seven Curriculum in Botswana

Dr Magdeline Chilalu Mannathoko

University of Botswana

Gaborone, Botswana

Abstract. There are various curricula models in Art and Design, some of which are Critical Studies, Arts Propel and Discipline Based Art Education (DBAE). While these models theoretically have different foci, they are essentially similar in the critical content areas from which they draw their disciplinary knowledge and skills. These are listed under the DBAE as Art History, Art Criticism, Production and Aesthetics. The four disciplinary content areas are critical in the development of fundamental knowledge and skills in Art and Design. Production entails that students apply the art elements and principles of design while at the same time drawing a critical eye from aesthetics. Students explore a variety of media in different ways. They also ask philosophical questions in the process as well as drawing ideas from historical contexts. These are the four things that students do with art. The purpose of this paper is to find out the extent to which the Art and Design curriculum in Botswana is reflective of the fundamental principles of DBAE which has pervaded most art curricula in different countries.

Content analysis was done on the existing syllabus and other policy documents that inform the curriculum to identify overlaps. The study was an Action Research and it involved sixty-six level three Art specialists in-service student-teachers from the University of Botswana who worked in groups to share their Art teaching experiences in relation to DBAE. They later identified and categorised Art objectives stipulated in the Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) syllabus according to DBAE disciplines. When presenting their findings, Student-teachers concluded that Art Production and Art Criticism were effectively addressed during curriculum development compared to the other two disciplines. Nevertheless, they argued that objectives which required learners to explore colour schemes covered 'Aesthetics' and the ones seeking for explanation of Visual forms can address 'Art History' As a result, the study recommends that an evaluation be done to Art education in the CAPA to include the components of DBAE. Teacher-training institutions also need to prepare students-teachers to incorporate DBAE components in their instruction.

Key Words:

Creative and Performing Arts; Art Education; Attainment Targets; Objectives; Art and Design curricula models.

Introduction

Art as a discipline was recently introduced in Botswana schools. It was introduced at junior secondary school (1992) earlier than in lower primary schools (in 2002). To me this is an anomaly as there is likely to be unsequential development of the subject. At upper primary art was introduced in 2005. Before the introduction of a curricula syllabus called Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA), art in Botswana primary schools was taught without a guideline, therefore, it was optional (Mannathoko, 2015). Among some of major innovations in the Botswana school curriculum was the suggestion to introduce practical subjects among them art and design, art and craft then (Report of the National Commission on Education, 1993) (RNCE). This ideas was subsequently adopted in 1994 under the Revised National Policy on Education (1994) and this gave birth to the CAPA syllabus in 2002 (Phuthego, 2007). The main aim for the introduction of practical subjects was to develop technological thinking and manipulative skills in learners. Such appreciation would lay the foundation for national development at an early stage. CAPA drew its content from disciplines that include home economics, art and craft, business studies, design technology, dance and drama and physical education (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit, 2002).

The grouping of these subjects under the umbrella CAPA was recommended by the American agency called 'Cream Wright' which was assigned by the Ministry of Education, Skills and Development to review the primary school curriculum (Phibion, 2006). To account for this combination, the agency explained that CAPA subjects were put together to facilitate project teaching and integration (Wright, 1995). Moreover, the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit (2002, 2005) has stipulated in the CAPA syllabus, Attainment Targets, which guide teachers on what is expected of pupils at the end of each level of learning (lower and upper primary). These Attainment Targets are categorised into four aspects for lower primary: Knowledge and Understanding, Manipulative Skills, Creativity and Attitudes. For Upper Primary skills were increased by adding the aspect of 'Communication' and hence making them five in this level. The Attainment Targets are the basis upon which the Botswana Examination Council (BEC) will base their examination questions on, to diagnose the pupils' ability at the end of each of the two levels. The Department further generated the general and specific objectives which define the content to be delivered at each level of learning. "The CAPA syllabus' main aims, are to help students develop creativity skills; problem solving aptitudes, critical thinking competencies, aesthetic recognition and appreciation, psychomotor dexterity along with positive attitudes towards practical work and productivity" as cited by the Curriculum and Evaluation Department of 2005.

Discipline-Based Art Education (DBAE) approach being the most recommended mode of teaching and learning Art internationally, is not mentioned in the CAPA syllabus and hence the need to investigate how teachers addressed it at both lesson planning and lesson presentation stages. The methodology enhances the interdisciplinary nature of the four DBAE disciplines (art production, art criticism, aesthetics, art history) discussed at length in the literature review section. DBAE framework has the greatest aim of teaching art in its social, cultural and historical context and it combines practical work with theoretical and contextual studies (Hayes, 2015). The four disciplines are aimed at enhancement of in-depth knowledge of visual arts among art students. Discipline-Based Art Education has been viewed by many art educationists to be the most effective approach in the teaching and learning of art. The methodology integrates the disciplines of aesthetics, production, art history and art criticism into a coherent body of knowledge. This study, therefore, examined the extent to which art education within the CAPA syllabus addressed DBAE component. The study was a result of a recommendation in one of my studies which examined education documents (Revised National Policy for Education, Basic Education and Primary Education programmes) to find out the extent to which they promoted DBAE. The study recommendation suggested a further research 'to investigate the extent to which teachers addressed DBAE disciplines during instruction'. Two major questions guiding this study can be put forward as:

- How do the art education topics and objectives address DBAE framework?
- To what extent do strategies and methodologies in art address DBAE approach?

Literature Review

This section discusses literature related to the study with more focus on Discipline-Based Art Education framework; since all data was based on this approach. DBAE is a curricula model that draws its content from the four disciplines which will be discussed later in this section. It was designed by the Paul Getty Trust in America in the early 1980s to support a diminished emphasis on studio instruction and encouraged education across four aforementioned disciplines within the arts (Greer, 1993). Following its footing in 1982, the Getty Education Institute for the Arts based in America, recommended DBAE as an effective approach to teaching art, arguing that it helps learners experience the visual arts in a variety of ways. According to Greer (1993) the institution's recommendation was an adoption of the ideas of art educators who had been advocating a more integrative methodology that draws its knowledge and skills competences from the four disciplines which follows: The first discipline, production; is simply, how to create an artwork. It involves creative use of tools and art equipment in innovative ways. It results in tangible studio products that demonstrate critical thinking and imagination processes and art students get stimulated as they explore or manipulate art media (Greene, 2014).

Art production is a critical component in any art programme. It is a domain that promotes kinaesthetic development as students express themselves in some

visual medium. Students are encouraged to explore a variety of media in the process of production. They learn the peculiarities of different media. They are also exposed to multi-media studies in which they learn how to combine media in expressive ways. Students become masters of different media. According to Greene (2014) studio production gives students the opportunity to express themselves and show their individuality.

Another domain, art criticism, is equally important. In simple terms art criticism is 'talking about art'. It involves discussing, evaluating, interpreting and analysing various aspects of art such as style, media and the use of art elements and principles of design (Day and Hurwitz, 2012). Students carry out critiques both verbal and in written form which heighten their understanding of the art forms and their social context. As recommended by Feldman (1994) art criticism follows four chronological steps, namely, description, analysis, interpretation and judgement. Description involves describing what you see in the artwork including the 'credit line' information. In the second step, students analyse how visual art elements such as colour, texture, shape are organised into principles of design such as balance, variety, harmony, rhythm and proportion (Ragans, 2000). Talking about art elements and principles of design develops students understanding of art as a means of visual communication (Lampert, 2006). Art Criticism uses several areas of Bloom's Taxonomy but also involves higher levels of thinking. The third step, interpretation focuses on the diagnosis of the artwork, to get its meaning while the last step, judgement, allows the viewers to examine whether the artwork is successful or not, looking at how the art elements were used. It also allows for personal feelings about an artwork, that is whether one likes or dislikes the piece of work, with justification to their choices. Eskine and Kozbelt (2015) view this stage as the critical judgement of specific artworks which allows viewers to look within themselves and ask why they like or dislike the piece of artwork. Choices can vary from one person to another since it allows for individual opinions about the artifact. Thus, involving children in this step will develop their critical, problem solving, self-reliant, self-esteem and creativity skills (Schabmann et al, 2015).

Art History is described as the examination of the artists and art's contribution to the societies and cultures. Studying art history helps students to understand how visual communication has evolved overtime (Dash, 2006). It includes the authors of the works and information about the work itself. Students get to understand the artists themselves and the environment in which they functioned, the historical periods and unfolding of events in time and space. We get to understand the evolution of artistic styles and factors that influenced them (Bamford, 2006). Thus, art work provides a visual record of the socio-cultural changes over time, thus insights into the history of a people. It further provides valuable insights and information about the present. Art and culture cannot be separated from one another because both relates to the actions and continuation of a people (Mannathoko, 2013). As a result, art students need to study art history so that they get to understand how the artists understood their media, means of expression as well as the philosophical underpinning their practices. This leads to a better understanding of current practices which ideally are based on the history and how art evolved through time (Merwe, 2007). This kind of

methodology enables students to relate the past and the present and put their art and understanding of art in context and comparison.

Art educationists have proven that art history relates to social studies as it helps us examine historical events through an artist's eyes. The discipline answers the following questions: Why was the artwork created? How was it used? and What was its purpose? Aesthetics on the other hand, deals with philosophical questions, questions that address the nature of art and the beauty of phenomena. It interrogates the notion of beauty and its relativity. It addresses the questions on our judgement of art, whether good or bad (Day and Hurwitz, 2012). We all react emotionally to artworks. The work of art can upset or excite us. Thus, our values, experiences and thoughts of beauty influence what we think about the art object. There are various activities that we can do with students that challenge their understanding of the aesthetic domain. They can be asked to define the subject and its nature. They should be asked to interrogate its nature and epistemological origins. They learn to differentiate art from what is not art. They identify art that belongs to the canon and why others cannot be similarly canonised. Historicised works of art are identified and studied in detail. In their philosophical inquiry, students make reference to socio-cultural factors that have an influence on art production. They examine beliefs and values that influence production and broaden their conceptual grasp of the nature of artistic expression. A critical dimension of aesthetics is that it enables students to appreciate art for its own sake without making reference to specific cultural performances as models of good aesthetics. It therefore removes those cultural barriers and limitations that could hinder them from an informed appreciation of art from the other.

Through art criticism students develop the ability to justify their opinions and positions. Moreover, Aesthetics helps students realise what kind of art pleases most people. This is also helpful for them when decorating their homes and choosing clothes. Furthermore, critical skills are used in Aesthetics because questions such as; why one feels that way or why you came to a specific conclusion may arise. As a result, Aesthetics sometimes go hand-in-hand with Art Criticism. A number of people fail to differentiate aesthetics from art criticism. However both are important in the development of critical and reflective thinking. It is important to note that there is no one answer to a given question. Diverse answers are all important. What is important is the effort to work towards a solution. Such aesthetic interrogation is what is critical in the two disciplines of aesthetics and art criticism. To address or to find solution for the provided question is extremely significant. Thus, DBAE approach is designed to insure that all learners obtain an in-depth study of art (Dhillon, 2006). This framework has been proven through time and research therefore, it should be seriously considered by all the art teachers. Agosto (1993) in Dobbs (1993) shares conclusions drawn from various researchers on DBAE implementation. She says results revealed that students who approach their art from the DBAE are in a position to construct their own personalised knowledge as opposed to universalised knowledge. Their studio art is better informed and quality is generally better. They have a broader perspective in their approach to

art including their art and language comprehension and vocabularies which are significantly enhanced. As a result, having an in-depth understanding of art entails heightened abilities and capabilities to think critically, create, to write, to evaluate and value art products.

Research Methodology

The paper aimed at examining the extent to which Botswana primary school art curriculum and its pedagogical instruction addressed DBAE approach which is believed by most art educationists in the Western countries to be the most effective method of teaching and learning art. The study adopted a type of education research called 'Action Research'. The method is sometimes called 'participatory action research' since it includes findings by performing actions. The method concentrates on a person carrying out findings with other people to reach a conclusion. Mills (2014) states that Action research in education is about investigating one's own practice in educational set ups. It involves gathering data on their own teaching and students learning in their particular contexts. This is linked to Dewey's, Harbermas' and Schon's reflective practice critical in the generation of self-knowledge. One can also investigate their operational environments from a broader perspective such as the school environment, resources and other factors that have a bearing on students learning outcomes and performances. The aim is to improve practice by the individual or participants in the given context.

According to Brundrett and Rhodes (2014) the purpose of action research is to develop teacher researchers who are able to creatively solve everyday problems encountered in the school context for the improvement of their own teaching and students learning, improve curriculum and adapt instructional or assessment strategies. The study adopted the 'Focus group' method of interview under qualitative research design. The decision to use focus group strategy was prompted by Stewart and Shamdasani's (1990) ideas of focus group process cited in Pickard (2007, p. 220). The aforementioned authors suggest the following situations in which focus group discussions can be used: obtaining general background information about a topic of interest; generating research hypotheses that can be submitted to further research and testing using more quantitative approaches; stimulating new ideas and creative concepts; diagnosing the potential for problems with a new program, service or product; generating impressions of products, programs, services institutions, or other products of interest; learning how respondents talk about a phenomenon of interest which may facilitate quantitative research tools and interpreting previously obtained qualitative results. Adopting and adapting Stewart and Shamdasani's (1990) advice, data was collected through engagement of participants in groups, to examine the CAPA syllabus specifically, the art component, in relation to DBAE framework. Participants were third-year in-service student-teachers who were pursuing their primary education degree in the University of Botswana as art education specialised. Thus, the study covered what was practised in rural and urban learning contexts of Botswana.

The geographical areas were sampled that way because students came from various regions of the country under different cultural context and hence a good representation of the study. I found it necessary to use this diverse and representative sample so as to adequately cater for diverse contexts from which the learners came from and teacher contexts articulating the CAPA curriculum and methodology. Such an approach is emphasised by Parlett and Hamilton (1972). The study was also informed by Paul Getty Trust's theory of Discipline Based Art Education (DBAE) which advocated for encompassing the four disciplinary categories for the purposes of teaching art. DBAE was introduced in America in the early 1980s. According to Phung and Fendler, (2015) the approach was designed to support a diminished emphasis on studio teaching and encouraged education across the four aforementioned art disciplines. In-service students-teachers from primary schools were found to be the most appropriate target group as they were practicing teachers who were implementers of the CAPA curriculum. Fifty-one (77%) of the participants held Diploma in Education as art specialists while fifteen (23%) were art education non-specialists teachers when pursuing diploma. The study focused on standard seven class as it is the highest level of learning in primary school therefore, having mature students who qualifies to a comprehensive art education advocated by DBAE approach. They were assigned to first identify the objectives which addressed DBAE approach and later categorise the selected objectives according to specific DBAE components believed to be relating to them.

In addition, students were required to suggest activities which could be developed during planning and teaching processes to cater for the omitted DBAE disciplines. Prior to engaging students in the examination of the art education curriculum, they were engaged in an activity to share their experiences on how they implemented art modules within the CAPA syllabus. I called this group 'Pre-Focus Group'. Groups later presented their consolidated results which showed no evidence of having knowledge of DBAE framework. This prompted a formal class to introduce students to DBAE approach and later engaged them in a second group activity which I named 'Post-Focus Group'. At this stage, the case study student-teachers were required to apply what they learnt and hence check their understanding since they were in-service teachers who were expected to implement what they learnt to promote DBAE and hence making art education rich in all aspects of learning. The next stage involved group presentations of their 'Post-Focus Group' findings and opinions to colleagues in class which led to common agreement as to which objectives in the curriculum addressed specific DBAE disciplines.

Data was then consolidated so as to be disseminated to other academicians who may use information for development of art education in their institutions. The focus-group strategies followed to collect data were found to be very appropriate for this type of study as per Packard's (2007) advice that "focus group can be used at any point in the research design. During the early stages of an investigation focus groups can allow you to explore a topic, to establish just what the salient issues surrounding the topic are and what requires further investigation. Using 'open' focus groups allows your research participants to

talk about the things that they feel are significant” (p. 220). As a result, the focus group method provided a useful guide to further studies as the results from the ‘Pre-Focus group prompted the next step which is teaching DBAE to student-teachers and assign them to examine the CAPA syllabus in relation to DBAE. The themes for discussion are centered around teacher competences in handling the DBAE curriculum and student learning activities in this curriculum model.

Results

In this section I present the results in two main categories as data from student-teachers is in two folds: ‘Pre-Focus Groups’ where participants shared their teaching in art and ‘Post- Focus Groups’ where they examined the art education modules in relation to DBAE framework.

Pre-Focus Groups: Sharing Experiences in the Teaching of Art

This section addresses the second research question which sought to find out the extent to which strategies and methodologies used in Botswana primary schools infuse aspects of DBAE as a curricula model. As aforementioned, student-teachers were engaged in ‘Pre-Focus Groups’ to share their experiences of how they planned and taught art as a subject. This was after realising that the focus of the art education objectives was on ‘art production’ and a bit of the other three, art history being the least covered after the study which prompted this research. This was to find out the extent to which DBAE approach was catered for during the implementation of the art curriculum. In terms of planning, participants said schemes of work were done at regional level. According to responses, all regions had teachers selected from schools to work together under the supervision of the Education Officers. They were tasked with coming up with a common scheme of work which could be used by all schools in a region for uniformity, since they had common mid-examinations. This according to the case study student-teachers involved just listing topics for a term so as to have common arrangement. They explained with concern that, not all teachers who were involved had knowledge of the subject and in some instances the whole team lacked knowledge and skills in all the CAPA subjects. When responding to approaches and methods of teaching art, all participants concurred that they followed what was dictated by the specific objectives. For example, if the objective required pupils to list art elements, they did exactly that since the examination questions were guided by the objectives.

To check student- teachers’ effort in making art education comprehensive, a guiding question was framed in the context of how student teachers made sure their teaching addressed the CAPA attainment targets and how they incorporated DBAE model into their teaching. All participants showed no knowledge of the two concepts ‘attainment targets’ and ‘DBAE’ approach although the CAPA syllabus stipulated ‘attainment targets’ which informed the designed objectives for each discipline listed under CAPA subject. Feedback from student-teachers therefore, shows the need to help teachers understand the nature of art as a subject and introduce them to effective approaches to teaching and learning art, thus, equipping them with necessary skills and knowledge which can help produce pupils with comprehensive art education. Mannathoko

(2009) is of the view that if well implemented, DBAE strategy has the greatest aim of teaching art in its social, cultural, and historical context and it combines practical work with theoretical and contextual studies. She builds on the premise that art is best approached from an interdisciplinary/integrative mode of fusing the four DBAE disciplines, namely, art history, art criticism, art production and aesthetics. This approach gives a holistic means of learning as opposed to the fragmented and segmented approach. This philosophy of art according to Walling (2000) came as a follow up of Bruner's (1960) notion of giving students an understanding of the fundamental structure of art. The good thing about the strategy offered by DBAE to teach the arts using an integrated disciplines approach is that, it does not only change what most art teachers teach but also alters the view of the nature and value of art education. Having knowledge in DBAE therefore, could assist teachers to identify gaps in the art curriculum and come up with activities to biff the content. Thus, student-teachers were introduced to the model of DBAE after realising their lack of knowledge in the area. To check their understanding and preparing them for incorporation of the approach when going back to schools, students were later tasked to examine the CAPA syllabus specifically standard seven art education section in relation to DBAE. They were to identify objectives addressing DBAE disciplines and categorise them as shown in table 2 in the next section.

Post-Focus Groups: Examination of the Art Education Objectives within the CAPA syllabus in relation to DBAE

The task under this theme was also designed to respond to the first research question which was to investigate the extent to which upper primary art education objectives addressed DBAE. As aforementioned, student-teachers were tasked to examine the art education aspect of CAPA to identify objectives addressing DBAE components and categorise them as shown in table 1. In addition, students were required to suggest activities which pupils could be engaged in to close the identified gaps. Some of the suggestions were an extension of existing objectives while some were newly designed to cater for omitted disciplines. I have extracted standard seven Art education general objectives listed in the CAPA syllabus and categorised them according to the DBAE disciplines they address. Thereafter, specific objectives designed by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit (2005) which are stipulated in the CAPA syllabus were arranged according to the DBAE disciplines that they match and inserted in table 1. The general objectives as per the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit (2005) state that at the end of standard seven, learners should be able to: use art elements and principles in drawing (*Art Production*); develop skills and techniques of colour schemes (*Art production*); apply skills and techniques in batik making (*Art production*); apply skills and techniques in ornament making (*Art production*); develop skills and techniques in sculpture making by carving (*Art production*) and develop skills and techniques of sculpture making by construction (*Art production*).

These results reveal that standard seven art education has six general objectives which are all advocating 'art production' discipline. There is no evidence of emphasis on the other three disciplines namely; criticism, art history and aesthetics.

Table 1: Categories of Standard 7 Art Education Specific Objectives (from 2005 CAPA syllabus)

according to DBAE

Topic	Art Criticism	Art History	Art Production	Aesthetics
Drawing (Art elements & principles)	-Analyse art elements & principles in a given artwork.	N/A	- Explore the use of art elements & principles in drawing. -Create a composition using art elements & principles.	-Analyse art elements & principles in a given artwork. * - Explore the use of art elements & principles in drawing. *
Painting (Colour schemes)	-Recognise the use of colour schemes in an artwork. *	N/A	- Explore with colour schemes in painting. -Create a composition using a chosen colour scheme.	-Recognise the use of colour schemes in an artwork. *
2-Dimensional Crafts (Batik)	-Define batik. *	Experiment with artificial & natural dyes in batik making. *	-Experiment with artificial & natural dyes in batik making. -Explore the use of tools & materials in batik making. -Create a batik work such as scarf, skirt & wall hanging.	-Experiment with artificial & natural dyes in batik making. * -Explore the use of tools & materials in batik making. *
3-Dimensional Crafts (Body ornaments)	-Explain body ornaments. * -Identify types of ornaments. *	-Explore different materials & techniques for making body ornaments. * -Make body ornaments using different materials. *	-Decorate jewellery made from paper by painting & texturing. -Explore different materials & techniques for making body ornaments. -Make body ornaments using different materials.	-Decorate jewellery made from paper by painting & texturing. * -Explore different materials & techniques for making body ornaments. * -Make body ornaments using different materials. *
Sculpture (Carving)	-Recognise examples of sculpture made by carving.	Identify materials suitable for sculpture making by carving. *	-Explore with tools, materials & techniques in sculpture making by carving. -Create a sculpture	-Recognise examples of sculpture made by carving. * -Explore with tools, materials &

			by carving either in relief or in the round.	techniques in sculpture making by carving. * -Identify materials suitable for sculpture making by carving. *
Construction	-Explain mobile, relief & freestanding sculptures. *	-Explore with tools, materials & techniques in sculpture making by construction. *	-Explore with tools, materials & techniques in sculpture making by construction. -Construct a sculpture using appropriate materials & techniques.	-Explore with tools, materials & techniques in sculpture making by construction. *

Like the general objectives, specific objectives shown in Table 1 also show emphasis on the discipline of 'art production' because from the 16 (55%) specific objectives identified as directly addressing DBAE from the overall total of 29, 15 (94%) were said to advocate art production while 1 (6%) focused on 'art criticism'. In addition, students identified 23 specific objectives which could be adopted to cater for the omitted disciplines. 6 (26%) of these objectives were attached to 'art criticism', 5 (22%) to 'art history' and 12 (52%) to 'aesthetics'. Examples of activities pupils could be engaged in to cover for the omitted objectives were suggested. It is important to note that some of these objectives were adopted from the already existing objectives under art criticism and art production in table 1 while some were newly identified from the syllabus and added to the table. Activities were designed to suit specific disciplines as shown in the examples below: This included 'art history' under the topics 'Drawing' and 'Painting' as the discipline was not attached to any specific objective. Drawing & Painting under art history: Student-teachers were of the same view that drawing and painting media and techniques used in the past including purposes of the images created should be introduced to upper classes in primary schools to prepare them for 'art history' courses at high education.

Activities suggested included: introducing students to rock paintings; scratched wood work and branded leather work. The objectives under art criticism state that pupils should be able to talk about artwork and apply art elements and principles of design were said to can develop pupils' aesthetics skills because they will be exposed to various artworks and analysing them will help them understand the artists' intensions and hence appreciate the works which is 'aesthetics. In addition, the findings further reveals that as pupils experiment with the visual elements which is an objective for 'drawing' under 'art production', they will incorporate ideas learnt when analysing art pieces and

hence showing appreciation of other artists' work which will result in the discipline of 'aesthetics'. Moreover, the objective which states that pupils should 'recognise the use of colour schemes' in an artwork was adopted and adapted to suit 'art criticism' and 'aesthetics', the explanation being that before children use colour, they need to learn its importance and how it can communicate different expressions and reality and that knowledge can only be gained through discussion of artworks and hence pupils appreciating colours around them. Steers (2005) concurs with this idea that children understand art better if involved in art criticism. 2-Dimensional Crafts (Batik) The objective 'Define batik' was placed under the discipline of 'art criticism' with the justification that the definition of batik incorporate its processes therefore, for children to understand the technique, the teacher should bring a sample for them to discuss looking at how media and art elements were used in a design to address the design principles. This view too can also lead to the discipline of 'aesthetics' as pupils will appreciate other designers' work and benefit from their ideas when creating their own work.

Furthermore, 'experimenting with improvised materials such as dyes from natural matter in fabric design which is an objective under 'art production' in table 3, was said to can also address 'art history' and 'aesthetics' in the sense that discussion of artificial dyes will lead to talking about batik media and techniques used in the past such as boiling roots and leaves with colour to dye fabric for decoration purposes or to communicate a certain culture. Student-teachers said children will later on engage in the use of batik making tools and other materials. (Objective under art production) assuming that they will be allowed to explore both artificial and natural media and techniques and hence appreciate both of them which is 'aesthetics'. With respect to 3-Dimensional Crafts (Body ornaments); suggestions were made that objectives adopted for 'art criticism' 'explain body ornaments' and 'identify types of ornaments' could be covered by bringing different samples to class and asking pupils to identify materials used and explain the processes they think were followed to create the product.

One of the student-teachers commented that the type or name of the ornaments is derived from the material used and gave an example of beads necklace that they are made from beads. As shown in table 3, the two objectives on exploration of materials and making of body ornaments using different materials were adopted from the discipline of 'art production' to also cover 'art history' and 'aesthetics'. Student-teachers suggested that under art history, pupils should be exposed to materials and techniques used in the past such as clay, snail shells and dry wild fruits beads so as to appreciate the work of ornament which evolved over time which informs the present. According to Mannathoko and Major (2013) exposing children to a variety of media develop their creativity skills and hence gain confidence in their creation of artwork. Sculpture (Carving): The objective 'recognise examples of sculpture made by carving' was seen by student- teachers to can cover 'art criticism' and 'aesthetics' arguing that children can only be able to differentiate sculptures if engaged in an activity which allows for deeper understanding of their media and techniques and even their roles thus, resulting in appreciation which is aesthetics in art

perspective. They therefore, suggested that teachers could bring samples or take children for an art tour to a relevant art centre for them to critique sculptures having guiding questions or statements designed by the teacher to focus children on the activity. 'Identifying materials suitable for sculpture making by carving' objective categorised under 'art history' was said to can cover art history if children can be taught about the role of sculptures in the past, how they were created and media used then later given images of various sculptures both created in the past and contemporary ones to categorise according to 'Traditional' and 'Contemporary' sculptures.

Examples were given as clay, wood, aluminium, plaster of paris and papier maché sculptures. Chanda (1993) has discussed types and roles of African sculptures in the past, giving an example of a small wooden human figure sculpture which was tied to women who had problems of giving birth. They were also other types buried in secret areas and honoured as they were believed to be ancestors with powers that could destroy the community and no one was allowed to go to the place or else disaster would be experienced by the whole community. Finally, students concurred that two objectives based on exploration of sculpture media and materials and the proper identification of such materials under 'art history' was adopted to can also cover the discipline of 'aesthetics' with the argument that as children understand sculpture of the past and explore various media and techniques, they will understand them broadly and appreciate sculpture created in different times and thus, developing aesthetics skills. Construction The objective 'explain mobile, relief & freestanding sculptures' was believed if adopted could cater for 'art criticism' with the justification that children can be exposed to the images or real sculptures and allowed to discuss them in terms of the media and techniques used to create each of the three types. The student who suggested the activity explained to colleagues that children will understand better if engaged in critiquing the sculptures rather than just explaining the concepts. With 'art history' and 'aesthetics', an objective on exploration of sculpture materials and tools was adopted from 'art production' and students agreed that the two disciplines can be covered by an activity discussed under sculpture (carving) which advocate exposure of children to sculptures created over time and hence promote the discipline of 'aesthetics'. Educationists such as Lindstron (2007) and Bain (2004) advice educators to effectively engage children in all the four aspects of DBAE so as to produce citizens who are diverse and who can face all the challenges in life.

Conclusions and Recommendations

The document analysis data revealed that DBAE was not mentioned in the art education within the CAPA syllabus. Nevertheless, some of the general objectives and specific objectives linked well with the DBAE disciplines. The objectives emphasised the discipline of 'Art Production' with less focus on 'Art History'. In addition, the 'Pre-Focus Group' data has revealed that all the student-teachers lacked knowledge of DBAE framework as they have not been considering components of the DBAE when implementing art education modules within the CAPA syllabus. However, after being introduced to the approach, they showed a lot of understanding as they were able to identify the

objectives from the CAPA, matching DBAE disciplines and placed each at the relevant discipline.

They further managed to come up with activities which could be implemented to cover for the omissions. The study therefore; recommends a further study to make a follow-up with students who were engaged in this project to see how far and how well they implement what they learnt in terms of DBAE framework. It would also be of benefit to the education system in Botswana to incorporate DBAE approach in the arts syllabus so as to guide teachers who could be lacking knowledge of this important approach to art teaching and learning. Thus, the intension is to organise a workshop for various education personnel to share with them the DBAE approach to teaching the arts.

References

- Agosto, M. (retrieved from www.buffaloschools.org, 28 January, 2016). Comprehensive Discipline- Based Art Education. Buffalo: Art Education Department.
- Bain, c. (2004). Today's student teachers: prepared to teach versus suited to teach? *The Journal of the National Art Education Association*, 57 (3), 42 – 45.
- Bamford, a. (2006). *The wow factor: global research compendium on the impact of the arts in education*. New York: Waxman Münster.
- Brundrett and Rhodes (2014). *Researching educational leadership and management: methods and approaches*. London: Sage.
- Chanda, J. (1993). *African arts and culture*. massachusetts: Davis publications.
- Chanda, J. and Basinger, A. M. (2000). *Understanding the cultural meaning of selected African Ntop statues. The use of art history constructivist inquiry methods*. Washington DC: Education resources information center.
- Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002). *Lower primary school syllabus, standard one to four*. Gaborone: Ministry of Education.
- Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2005). *Upper primary school syllabus, standard one to four*. Gaborone: Ministry of Education.
- Dash, P. (2006). 'Heritance, identity and belonging: African Caribbean students and art education.' *The International Journal of Art and Design Education*. 25 (3), 256 – 267. [doi: 10.1111/j.1476-8070.2006.00492.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1476-8070.2006.00492.x).
- Day, T. and Hurtwiz, A. (2012). *Children and their art: Art elementary and middle schools*. Boston: Wadsworth, Cengage Learning.
- Dhillon, P. A. (2006). *Aesthetics education*. Urbana-Champaign: The university of Illinois Press.
- Dobbs, S.M. (1992). *The DBAE handbook: An overview of the Discipline-Based Art Education*. Los Angels: Getty Centre for Education in the Arts.

- Eskine, K.J. and Kozbelt, A. (2015). *Art that moves: Exploring the embodied basis of art representation, production and evaluation*. New York: Springer Science and Business Media Dordrecht.
- Feldman, E.B. (1994). *Practical art criticism*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Greer, W.D. (1993). Developments in Discipline-Based Art Education (DBAE): From art education towards art education. *A Journal of Issues and Research*, 34 (2), 91-101. doi: [10.2307/1320446](https://doi.org/10.2307/1320446).
- Greene, T.P. et al, (2014). Arts education matters: We know, we measure it. *Education week*, 34 (13), 24.
- Hayes, P.A. (2015). *High quality visual arts education k-8, the student, the principal and the teacher*. Ann Arbor: Seattle Pacific University.
- Lampert, N. (2006). Critical thinking dispositions as an outcome of art education. *A Journal of Issues and Research in Art Education*, 47, (3), 215-228. doi: [10.2307/25475782](https://doi.org/10.2307/25475782).
- Lindstrom, L. (2007). Creativity: what is it? Can you assess it? Can it be taught? *International Journal of Art & Design Education*, (25) 1. doi: [10.1111/j.1476-8070.2006.00468.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1476-8070.2006.00468.x).
- Mannathoko, M.C. (2009). *Interpreting the new lower primary art and craft component of the Creative and Performing Arts, the Botswana national curriculum. Case studies of four primary schools in the south central and central north regions. An illuminative evaluation*. Cardiff: University of Wales Institute Cardiff.
- Mannathoko, M.C. and Major, T.E. (2013). An illuminative evaluation on practical art, craft and design instruction: The case of Botswana. *International Journal of High Education*, 2 (3), 54-61. doi:[10.5430/ijhe.v2n3p54](https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v2n3p54).
- Mannathoko, M.C. (2013). Community involvement in the teaching and learning of arts and culture in primary schools: A case of four primary schools in Botswana. *International Review of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 5 (2), 19-27.
- Mannathoko, M.C. (2015). Why the arts are not part of the examination family: The case of Botswana primary schools. *International Journal of Scientific Research and Education*, 3(12), 4736-4746. doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.18535/ij sre/v3i12.10>.
- Merwe, L. (2007). Assessment in the learning area of arts and culture. A South African perspective. *The Journal of Research in Teacher Education*, 14 (2), 51-68.
- Mills, G.E. (ed) (2014). *Action research: a guide for the teacher researcher*. Essex: Pearson Education Limited.
- Parlett, M. and Hamilton, D. (1972). *Evaluation as illumination: A new approach to the study of innovatory programmes*. Scotland: University of Edinburgh.
- Phibion, O.S. (2006). *Botswana primary school teachers' perception on the introduction of the creative and performing arts (CAPA). A case of Lobatse town (urban) and Tlokweng village (semi-urban) schools*. Gaborone: University of Botswana.

- Phung, T. and Fendler, L. (2015). A critique of knowledge-based arts education: Ars gracia through ranciére's aesthetics. *Journal of Education*, 3, (1), 177-191.
- Phuthego, M. (2007). An evaluation of the indigenous musical arts in the creative and performing arts syllabus and the implementation thereof in the primary schools curriculum in Botswana. Unpublished Dmusic thesis. Pretoria: University of Pretoria.
- Pickard, A.J. (2007). *Research methods in information*. London:Facet Publishing.
- Ragans, R. (ed) (2000). *Art talk*. Ohio: McGraw-Hill Publishing Company.
- Republic of Botswana, (1993). *Report of the national commission on education*. Gaborone: Government printers.
- Republic of Botswana, (1994). *The revised national policy on education*. Gaborone: Government printers.
- Schabmann et al (2015). Where does it come from? Developmental aspects of art appreciation. *International Journal of Behavioral Development*, 1-11. [doi: 10.1177/0165025415573642](https://doi.org/10.1177/0165025415573642)
- Steers, J. (2005). Orthodox, creativity and opportunity. *International Journal of Art & Design Education*, 25 (3), 297 - 307.
- Walling, D.R. (2000). *Rethinking: How art is taught - A critical convergence*. California: Corwin Press, Inc.
- Wright, C. (1995). *Subject combinations and time-tabling for basic education in Botswana*. Gaborone: Ministry of Education.